

Sample Answers for 2021 Categorisation Exam C

TABLE A			
Document	Category	Regarding independent claims	Reasons
2B1	(iii) Not of interest	Claims 1, 5 and 6	2B1 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1, 5 and 6, because it does not disclose an electric appliance with a temperature selector or a timer and does not disclose a set of browned bread slices that are coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.
2B2	(i) Of interest	6	Although the sandwich is browned under a broiler (single heating element) <u>without the ability to set a timer</u> in Document 2B2, this document is still of interest, because this document discloses a set of browned slices of bread that are coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.
	(iii) Not of Interest	1 and 5	2B2 is not of interest regarding claims 1 and 5, because the broiler used to toast the bread does not have a timer.
2B3	(iii) Not of interest	Claims 1, 5 and 6	2B3 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1, 5 and 6, because 2B3 was published (1996-July-15) after the priority date (1987-Feb 12) and the filing date (1988 Feb 5) of the patent in question.
2B4	(ii) Might be of interest	1 and 5	<p>2B4 might be of interest because it discloses: “an appliance for rapid and efficient heating incorporates one or a pair of heating elements, in conjunction with timing control, base insulation, and exterior covers.”(see page 5, lines 4-6)</p> <p>“The temperature at which the heating elements is heated is selected before the appliance is turned on. A sensor (not shown) detects when the heating elements have attained the selected temperature and relays the attained temperature to the thermostat that controls the heating of the heating elements. (see page 8, lines 28-31)</p> <p>“For example, a frozen pop tart placed in between the two heating elements will be heated through in exactly 40 seconds, whereas a slice of bread will be toasted by the pair of heating elements in exactly 5 seconds.” (see page 11, lines 4-7)</p> <p>Although 2B4 states that the applicant has “timing control” and that a frozen pop tart can be heated or a slice of bread can be toasted in a short span of time, there is no clear indication that the appliance has an adjustable timer for selecting a desired time for heating the one or more heating elements. The phrase “timing control” at page 5, lines 4-6 is ambiguous. It could be interpreted to mean that the applicant has a device for controlling the</p>

TABLE A			
Document	Category	Regarding independent claims	Reasons
			duration for heating the heating elements OR it could be interpreted to mean that the heating elements having the described structure enables the exact time (hence timing control) needed to heat a frozen pop tart or toast a slice of bread.
	(iii) Not of interest	6	2B4 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claim 6, because it does not disclose a set of browned slices of bread coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade
2B5	(i) Of Interest	1 and 5	2B5 is of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1 and 5, because (i) all of the claimed features in claims 1 and 5 are disclosed by 2B5 and (ii) 2B5 is an European patent publication that was filed on (1988-Jan 20) which is earlier than the filing date (1988-Feb 5) of the patent in question despite the fact that the publication date (1988 July 21) of 2B5 is after the filing date (1988-Feb 5)
	(iii) Not of interest	6	2B5 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claim 6, because 2B5 does not disclose a set of browned slices of bread coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.
2B6	(i) Of interest	1 and 5	2B6 is of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1 and 5, because (iii) all of the claimed features in claims 1 and 5 are disclosed by 2B6 and (iv) 2B6 was published 1981-Jun-23 which was before the priority date (1987-Feb 12) and filing date (1988-Feb 5) of the patent in question.
	(iii) Not of Interest	6	2B6 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claim 6, because it does not disclose a set of browned slices of bread coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
electric appliance	Patent Publication 2B6	“electrical contact cooking appliance such as a contact grill or waffle maker” (see p.2, lines 1-2)	Patent Publication 2B5	“toasting surface comprising a material of low thermal conductivity such as glass having one surface coated with a thin film of electrically conductive material through which electrical current is passed to raise the temperature of the opposite surface for toasting foods” see page 3, lines 2-5)
one or more heating elements located in proximity of an edible food to be heated;	Patent Publication 2B6	“the hotplates are close to the food to be cooked or heated”(see page 2, line 3) OR “...the upper hot plate 14 to be moved closer to the food to be heated or cooked.” (see page 2, lines 24-25)	Patent Publication 2B5	“It was discovered in accordance with the invention that toast, rolls and similar materials which are placed near the toasting surface of the toaster are browned uniformly and quickly and without the resulting blackened areas caused when using previous toasters.” (see page 3, lines 27-31) OR “A further feature of this invention is the provision of a handle support for pivotally supporting one toasting element of a cooperative pair of elements.” See page 4, lines 10-11

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
a temperature selector that is adjusted to a desired temperature at which the one or more heating elements will be heated	Patent Publication 2B6	“The contact cooking appliance also has a knob for selecting a particular heating temperature.” (see page 2, lines 9-10)	Patent Publication 2B5	<p>“The temperature of the toasting surface can be set by the user of the toaster by moving a lever of the toaster to select a temperature that falls in the range of between 300 and 600 F” See page 3, line 26-27).</p> <p>OR</p> <p>“The thermostat 74 includes a lever arm 78 which extends through a slot 80 in the front face of the toasting panel assembly 10 and which may be moved backwardly and forwardly , to adjust the temperature of the heating plates 54 on each of the toasting panel assemblies 10 and 13.” See page 6, lines 20-22</p>
a probe for sensing the actual temperature of the one or more heating elements	Patent Publication 2B6	“A temperature sensor within each hotplate measures the temperature of the hotplates.” (see page 2, lines 10-11)	Patent Publication 2B5	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of the heating plates 54. See page 5, lines 18-19 “

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
a controller that receives input from the probe and controls the heating of the one or more elements to maintain the desired temperature	Patent Publication 2B6	“Also located in the control box is a thermostat 228 that controls the heating of the hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214.” (see page 2, line 35 to page 3, lines1-2.	Patent Publication 2B5	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of the heating plates 54 in order to maintain the temperature selected by the user.” See page 5, lines 18-20. OR “A feature of the invention is that a thermostat element74 (FIGURE 3) for temperature control of the unit is mounted on a pair of spring members 76, and bolted to the underface of the panel assembly 10.” See page 6, line18-20
a timer that is adjustable to select a desired time for heating the one or more heating elements	Patent Publication 2B6	“The contact cooking appliance has a timer which after a pre-selectable time switches off the hotplate.” (see p2, lines 8-9) OR	Patent Publication 2B5	“The electrical socket member 44 is connected to a timer which can have a pre-selected duration chosen by the user for delivering current to the system.” See page 5, line 35 to page 6, line 1)

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
		<p>“On the device there is knob for setting the duration for heating the hotplates” (see page 2, line 13</p> <p>OR</p> <p>“A control box 24 containing a timer switch 25 is fitted to the top of the upper housing 12. A rotary knob 26 is used to set the desired cooking time to set the timer switch 25.” (see page 2, lines 26-27)</p>		
wherein the adjustment of the timer is independent of the adjustment of the temperature selector	Patent Publication 2B6	<p>See Fig 2 that shows a time setting knob 226 and a temperature selection knob 231 indicating that time and temperature can be independently adjusted.</p> <p>OR</p> <p>“A control box 224 is arranged on the upper housing 212 containing a timer switch 225 with a time setting knob 226 as well as a temperature selection knob 231. Also located in the control box is a thermocouple 228 that controls the heating of the</p>	Patent Publication 2B5	“It should be appreciated that the timer can be adjusted by the user independently of the temperature lever.” See page 6, lines 1-2.

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
		hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214.”		

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 5 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
A method for browning an edible food by using an electric appliance... comprising the steps of:	Patent Publication 2B6	“electrical contact cooking appliance such as a contact grill or waffle maker” (see p.2, lines 1-2)	Patent Publication 2B5	“toasting surface comprising a material of low thermal conductivity such as glass having one surface coated with a thin film of electrically conductive material through which electrical current is passed to raise the temperature of the opposite surface for toasting foods” see page 3, lines 2-5)

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 5 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
bringing one or more heating elements into proximity of the edible food to be browned	Patent Publication 2B6	“the hotplates are close to the food to be cooked or heated”(see page 2, line 3) OR “...the upper hot plate 14 to be moved closer to the food to be heated or cooked.” (see page 2, lines 24-25)	Patent Publication 2B5	“A further feature of this invention is the provision of a handle support for pivotally supporting one toasting element of a cooperative pair of elements and arranging the handle and one of the elements so that it may be balanced above the other element in an open position or swung downwardly over the other element. The handle construction is such that the top element may be positioned in close cooperating contact with the bottom element, when thin foods are to be toasted, or may be positioned in a raised spaced position above the other element when large foods, such as thick rolls, are to be toasted.” See page , lines 10-17
selecting a desired temperature to which the one or more elements are heated;	Patent Publication 2B6	“The contact cooking appliance also has a knob for selecting a particular heating temperature.” (see page 2, lines 9-10)	Patent Publication 2B5	“The temperature of the toasting surface can be set by the user of the toaster by moving a lever of the toaster to select a temperature that falls in the range of between 300 and 600 F” See page 3, line 26-27). OR

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 5 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
				“The thermostat 74 includes a lever arm 78 which extends through a slot 80 in the front face of the toasting panel assembly 10 and which may be moved backwardly and forwardly , to adjust the temperature of the heating plates 54 on each of the toasting panel assemblies 10 and 13.” See page 6, lines 20-22
selecting a desired time for heating independent of the selection of the temperature;	Patent Publication 2B6	See Fig 2 that shows a time setting knob 226 and a temperature selection knob 231 indicating that time and temperature can be independently adjusted. OR “A control box 224 is arranged on the upper housing 212 containing a timer switch 225 with a time setting knob 226 as well as a temperature selection knob 231. Also located in the control box is a thermocouple 228 that controls the heating of the hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214.	Patent Publication 2B5	The electrical socket member 44 is connected to a timer which can have a pre-selected duration chosen by the user for delivering current to the system. See page 5, line 35 to page 6, line 1)

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 5 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
heating the one or more elements for the desired time;	Patent Publication 2B6	“On the device there is knob for setting the duration for heating the hotplates” (see page 2, line 13	Patent Publication 2B5	“The electrical socket member 44 is connected to a timer which can have a pre-selected duration chosen by the user for delivering current to the system and thereby heating the heating plates 54 for the selected duration.” See page 5, line 35 – page 6, line 2.
sensing the temperature of the one or more heating elements;	Patent Publication 2B6	“A temperature sensor within each hotplate measures the temperature of the hotplates.” (see page 2, lines 10-11)	Patent Publication 2B5	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of the heating plates 54.” See page 5, lines 18-19
controlling the heating such that the one or more elements are heated to and maintained at the desired temperature	Patent Publication 2B6	“Also located in the control box is a thermocouple 228 that controls the heating of the hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214.” (see page 2, line 35 to page 3, lines1-2.	Patent Publication 2B5	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of the heating plates 54 in order to maintain the temperature selected by the user.” See page 5, lines 18-20. OR “A feature of the invention is that a thermostat element 74 (FIGURE 3) for

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 5 European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
				temperature control of the unit is mounted on a pair of spring members 76, and bolted to the underface of the panel assembly 10.” See page 6, line18-20

Table B

Features of Independent Claim No. 6 of European Patent No. EP Z ZZZ ZZZ	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 2B3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)
A set of browned slices of bread that are coated with a mixture of	Document No. 2B2	4 slices rye, whole grain or pumpernickel bread-see page 260, line 4.
butter	Document No. 2B2	2 tablespoons butter, at room temp see page 260, line 5.
peanut butter	Document No. 2B2	4-6 tablespoons Smooth Operator peanut butter see page 260, line 6.
marmalade	Document No. 2B2	1-2 tablespoons of marmalade see page 260, line 7.
wherein said set of browned slices of bread has been prepared by a method according to claim 5.	Document No. 2B2	2B2 does not disclose the process of claim 5, because the bread is browned using a broiler that has no settable timer.