

Sample Answers for 2021 Categorisation Exam D

Table A			
Document	Category	Regarding independent claims	Reasons
3C1	(ii) Might be of interest	1 and 5	<p>3C1 might be of interest because it discloses: “an appliance for rapid and efficient heating incorporates one or a pair of heating elements, in conjunction with timing control, base insulation, and exterior covers.”(see page 5, lines 4-6)</p> <p>“The temperature at which the heating elements is heated is selected before the appliance is turned on. A sensor (not shown) detects when the heating elements have attained the selected temperature and relays the attained temperature to the thermostat that controls the heating of the heating elements. (see page 8, lines 28-31)</p> <p>“For example, a frozen pop tart placed in between the two heating elements will be heated through in exactly 40 seconds, whereas a slice of bread will be toasted by the pair of heating elements in exactly 5 seconds.” (see page 11, lines 4-7)</p> <p>Although 3C1 states that the applicant has “timing control” and that a frozen pop tart can be heated or a slice of bread can be toasted in a short span of time, there is no clear indication that the appliance has an adjustable timer for selecting a desired time for heating the one or more heating elements. The phrase “timing control” at page 5, lines 4-6 is ambiguous. could be interpreted to mean that the applicant has a device for controlling the duration for heating the heating elements OR it could be interpreted to mean that the heating elements having the described structure enables the exact time (hence timing control) needed to heat a frozen pop tart or toast a slice of bread.</p>
	(iii) Not of interest	6	3C1 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claim 6, because it does not disclose a set of browned slices of bread coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.
3C2	(i) Of Interest	1 and 5	<p>3C2 is of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1 and 5, because</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) all of the claimed features in claims 1 and 5 are disclosed by 3C2 and (ii) 3C2 is an United States patent publication that was filed on (1988-Jan 20) which is earlier than the filing date (1988-Feb 5) of the patent in question, despite the fact that the publication date (1988 July 21) of 3C2 is after the filing date (1988-Feb 5).

Table A			
Document	Category	Regarding independent claims	Reasons
	(iii) Not of interest	6	3C2 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claim 6, because 3C2 does not disclose a set of browned slices of bread coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.
3C3	(iii) Not of interest	Claims 1, 5 and 6	3C3 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1, 5 and 6, because 3C3 was published (1996-July-15) after the priority date (1987- Feb 12) and filing date (1988 Feb 5) of the patent in question.
3C4	(i) Of interest	6	Although the sandwich is browned under a broiler (single heating element) <u>without the ability to set a timer</u> in Document 3C4, this document is still of interest, because this document discloses a set of browned slices of bread that are coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.
	(iii) Not of Interest	1 and 5	3C4 is not of interest regarding claims 1 and 5, because the broiler used to toast the bread does not have a timer.
3C5	(iii) Not of interest	Claims 1, 5 and 6	3C5 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1, 5 and 6, because it does not disclose an electric appliance with a temperature selector or a timer and does not disclose a set of browned bread slices that are coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade
3C6	(i) Of interest	1 and 5	3C6 is of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claims 1 and 5, because (iii) all of the claimed features in claims 1 and 5 are disclosed by 3C6 and (iv) 3C6 was published 1981-Jun-23 which was before the priority date (1987-Feb 12) and filing date (1988-Feb 5) of the patent in question
	(iii) Not of Interest	6	3C6 is not of interest from a novelty perspective regarding claim 6, because it does not disclose a set of browned slices of bread coated with a mixture of butter, peanut butter and marmalade.

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
electric appliance	Patent Publication 3C6	“electrical contact cooking appliance such as a contact grill or waffle maker” (see p.2, lines 1-2)	Patent Publication 3C2	“toasting surface comprising a material of low thermal conductivity such as glass having one surface coated with a thin film of electrically conductive material through which electrical current is passed to raise the temperature of the opposite surface for toasting foods” see page 3, lines 2-5)
one or more heating elements located in proximity of an edible food to be heated;	Patent Publication 3C6	“the hotplates are close to the food to be cooked or heated”(see page 2, line 3) OR “...the upper hot plate 14 to be moved closer to the food to be heated or cooked.” (see page 2, lines 24-25)	Patent Publication 3C2	“It was discovered in accordance with the invention that toast, rolls and similar materials which are placed near the toasting surface of the toaster are browned uniformly and quickly and without the resulting blackened areas caused when using previous toasters.” (see page 3, lines 27-31) OR “A further feature of this invention is the provision of a handle support for pivotally supporting one toasting element of a

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
				cooperative pair of elements.” See page 4, lines 10-11
a temperature selector that is adjusted to a desired temperature at which the one or more heating elements will be heated	Patent Publication 3C6	“The contact cooking appliance also has a knob for selecting a particular heating temperature.” (see page 2, lines 9-10)	Patent Publication 3C2	“The temperature of the toasting surface can be set by the user of the toaster by moving a lever of the toaster to select a temperature that falls in the range of between 300 and 600 F” See page 3, line 26-27). OR “The thermostat 74 includes a lever arm 78 which extends through a slot 80 in the front face of the toasting panel assembly 10 and which may be moved backwardly and forwardly , to adjust the temperature of the heating plates 54 on each of the toasting panel assemblies 10 and 13.” See page 6, lines 20-22
a probe for sensing the actual temperature of the	Patent Publication 3C6	“A temperature sensor within each hotplate measures the temperature of the hotplates.” (see page 2, lines 10-11)	Patent Publication 3C2	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
one or more heating elements				the heating plates 54. See page 5, lines 18-19”
a controller that receives input from the probe and controls the heating of the one or more elements to maintain the desired temperature	Patent Publication 3C6	“Also located in the control box is a thermostat 228 that controls the heating of the hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214. (see page 2, line 35 to page 3, lines1-2.”	Patent Publication 3C2	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of the heating plates 54 in order to maintain the temperature selected by the user.” See page 5, lines 18-20. OR “A feature of the invention is that a thermostat element74 (FIGURE 3) for temperature control of the unit is mounted on a pair of spring members 76, and bolted to the underface of the panel assembly 10.” See page 6, line18-20
a timer that is adjustable to select a desired time for heating the one or	Patent Publication 3C6	“The contact cooking appliance has a timer which after a pre-selectable time switches off the hotplate.” (see p2, lines 8-9)	Patent Publication 3C2	“The electrical socket member 44 is connected to a timer which can have a pre-selected duration chosen by the user for delivering current to the system.” See page 5, line 35 to page 6, line 1)

Table B				
Features of Independent Claim No. 1 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
more heating elements		OR “On the device there is knob for setting the duration for heating the hotplates” (see page 2, line 13 OR “A control box 24 containing a timer switch 25 is fitted to the top of the upper housing 12. A rotary knob 26 is used to set the desired cooking time to set the timer switch 25.” (see page 2, lines 26-27)		
wherein the adjustment of the timer is independent of the adjustment of the temperature selector	Patent Publication 3C6	See Fig 2 that shows a time setting knob 226 and a temperature selection knob 231 indicating that time and temperature can be independently adjusted. OR “A control box 224 is arranged on the upper housing 212 containing a timer switch 225 with a time setting knob 226 as well as a temperature selection knob 231. Also located in	Patent Publication 3C2	‘It should be appreciated that the timer can be adjusted by the user independently of the temperature lever.’ See page 6, lines 1-2.

Table B

Features of Independent Claim No. 1 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
		the control box is a thermocouple 228 that controls the heating of the hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214.”		

Table B

<p>Features of Independent</p> <p>Claim No. 5</p> <p>United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP</p>	<p>Reference Number of the Document of Interest</p> <p>(e.g. Document 3C3)</p>	<p>Location of Feature in the Document of Interest</p> <p>(e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)</p>	<p>Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest</p> <p>(if there is one)</p>	<p>Location of Feature in the Document of Interest</p>
<p>A method for browning an edible food by using an electric appliance... comprising the steps of:</p>	<p>Patent Publication 3C6</p>	<p>“electrical contact cooking appliance such as a contact grill or waffle maker” (see p.2, lines 1-2)</p>	<p>Patent Publication 3C2</p>	<p>“toasting surface comprising a material of low thermal conductivity such as glass having one surface coated with a thin film of electrically conductive material through which electrical current is passed to raise the temperature of the opposite surface for toasting foods” see page 3, lines 2-5)</p>
<p>bringing one or more heating elements into proximity of the edible food to be browned</p>	<p>Patent Publication 3C6</p>	<p>“the hotplates are close to the food to be cooked or heated” (see page 2, line 3)</p> <p>OR</p> <p>“...the upper hot plate 14 to be moved closer to the food to be heated or cooked. (see page 2, lines 24-25)</p>	<p>Patent Publication 3C2</p>	<p>“A further feature of this invention is the provision of a handle support for pivotally supporting one toasting element of a cooperative pair of elements and arranging the handle and one of the elements so that it may be balanced above the other element in an open position or swung downwardly over the other element. The handle construction is such that the top element may be positioned in close cooperating contact with the bottom element, when thin foods are to be toasted, or may be positioned in a raised spaced position above the other element when large foods, such as thick rolls, are to be toasted.” See page , lines 10-17</p>

Table B

Features of Independent Claim No. 5 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
selecting a desired temperature to which the one or more elements are heated;	Patent Publication 3C6	“The contact cooking appliance also has a knob for selecting a particular heating temperature.” (see page 2, lines 9-10)	Patent Publication 3C2	“The temperature of the toasting surface can be set by the user of the toaster by moving a lever of the toaster to select a temperature that falls in the range of between 300 and 600 F” See page 3, line 26-27). OR “The thermostat 74 includes a lever arm 78 which extends through a slot 80 in the front face of the toasting panel assembly 10 and which may be moved backwardly and forwardly , to adjust the temperature of the heating plates 54 on each of the toasting panel assemblies 10 and 13.” See page 6, lines 20-22
selecting a desired time for heating independent of the selection of the temperature;	Patent Publication 3C6	See Fig 2 that shows a time setting knob 226 and a temperature selection knob 231 indicating that time and temperature can be independently adjusted. OR	Patent Publication 3C2	“The electrical socket member 44 is connected to a timer which can have a pre- selected duration chosen by the user for delivering current to the system.” See page 5, line 35 to page 6, line 1)

Table B

Features of Independent Claim No. 5 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
		“A control box 224 is arranged on the upper housing 212 containing a timer switch 225 with a time setting knob 226 as well as a temperature selection knob 231. Also located in the control box is a thermocouple 228 that controls the heating of the hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214.”		
heating the one or more elements for the desired time;	Patent Publication 3C6	“On the device there is knob for setting the duration for heating the hotplates” (see page 2, line 13	Patent Publication 3C2	“The electrical socket member 44 is connected to a timer which can have a pre-selected duration chosen by the user for delivering current to the system and thereby heating the heating plates 54 for the selected duration.” See page 5, line 35 – page 6, line 2.
sensing the temperature of the one or more heating elements;	Patent Publication 3C6	“A temperature sensor within each hotplate measures the temperature of the hotplates.” (see page 2, lines 10-11)	Patent Publication 3C2	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of the heating plates 54.” See page 5, lines 18-19

Table B

Features of Independent Claim No. 5 United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)	Reference Number of the Another Document of Interest (if there is one)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest
controlling the heating such that the one or more elements are heated to and maintained at the desired temperature	Patent Publication 3C6	“Also located in the control box is a thermocouple 228 that controls the heating of the hotplate 214 by receiving signals from the temperature sensor 229 in hotplate 214.” (see page 2, line 35 to page 3, lines1-2.	Patent Publication 3C2	“The U-shaped 10 thermostat is directing current to each of the plates 54 in response to a sensor that senses the temperature of the heating plates 54 in order to maintain the temperature selected by the user.” See page 5, lines 18-20. OR “A feature of the invention is that a thermostat element74 (FIGURE 3) for temperature control of the unit is mounted on a pair of spring members 76, and bolted to the underface of the panel assembly 10.” See page 6, line18-20

Table B

Features of Independent Claim No. 6 of United States Patent No. US P,PPP,PPP	Reference Number of the Document of Interest (e.g. Document 3C3)	Location of Feature in the Document of Interest (e.g. Feature ? is described as “a component having...” (please see page 2, lines 3-5 or Figure number 1)
A set of browned slices of bread that are coated with a mixture of	Document No. 3C4	4 slices rye, whole grain or pumpernickel bread-see page 260, line 4.
butter	Document No. 3C4	2 tablespoons butter, at room temp see page 260, line 5.
peanut butter	Document No. 3C4	4-6 tablespoons Smooth Operator peanut butter see page 260, line 6.
marmalade	Document No. 3C4	1-2 tablespoons of marmalade see page 260, line 7.
wherein said set of browned slices of bread has been prepared by a method according to claim 5.	Document No. 3C4	3C4 does not disclose the process of claim 5, because the bread is browned using a broiler that has no settable timer.